

HERITAGE ASSESSMENT

PROPOSAL TO EXTEND
THE BOUNDARIES OF THE
HO8 ELWOOD: GLENHUNTLY & ORMOND ROADS
HERITAGE OVERLAY

PETER ANDREW BARRETT

JULY 2019

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

I am advised by the City of Port Phillip that it is considering extending an existing heritage overlay, the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads, to include additional houses in Tiuna Grove, Elwood. These houses are No's 3, 5 and 7 Tiuna Grove.

I have inspected Tiuna Grove from the public realm, and reviewed the citation for the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads heritage overlay from the 'Port Phillip Heritage Review' (Version 27, October 2018). In that citation is a statement of significance for this heritage precinct, which is reproduced on page 8 of this report.

This heritage assessment has concluded that the proposal to extend the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads heritage overlay to include additional housing on the southeast side of Tiuna Grove, currently outside the heritage overlay boundaries, is appropriate.

I recommend that the heritage overlay is extended to include No's 3 and 5 Tiuna Grove as significant places to the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct; and No 7, which has undergone some change, but still reads as an original house of the street, be included as a contributory place within the boundaries of the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct.

One other house, No 15 Tiuna Grove, a bungalow, I have also recommended is included within the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct as a significant place.

In realigning the boundary of the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct, I suggest that Council look at removing the contemporary development at the southwest end of Tiuna Grove from this heritage overlay. These sites are No's 21-23, 25, 27, 29 and 31 Tiuna Grove. These contemporary developments are of no appreciable heritage value to the precinct.

I have also recommended that the statement of significance for the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads heritage overlay is amended, so as to be consistent with current heritage practice for the preparation of a statement of significance, and to be clearer as to what, why and how this precinct is of significance. I have prepared a draft statement of significance for this heritage overlay, which is at the end of this report.

METHODOLOGY

This heritage assessment is prepared with regard to the *Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance, The Burra Charter, 2013*, which is the standard of heritage practice in Australia.

In reviewing this proposal to extend the boundaries of this heritage overlay, I have referred to the Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning, Planning Practice Note No 1, 'Applying the Heritage Overlay', August 2018.

In the course of preparing this heritage assessment, I inspected Tiuna Grove from the public realm, as well as the broader heritage overlay. Two inspections were undertaken on Thursday 13 June 2019, and a further inspection undertaken on Thursday 4 July 2019.

In preparing this heritage assessment I reviewed the citation for the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads heritage overlay from the 'Port Phillip Heritage Review' (Version 27, October 2018). I have also reviewed Clause 43.01 Heritage Overlay, and other clauses of the *Port Phillip Planning Scheme* that pertain to heritage.

Building application plans for three of the houses, No's 3, 5 and 7 Tiuna Grove, that are proposed for inclusion within the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads heritage overlay, have been reviewed. These plans, which are held by the City of Port Phillip, provide the dates of construction, and guidance in determining the level of intactness of these dwellings.

DESCRIPTION

Tiuna Grove

Tiuna Grove extends between Ormond Road and Ormond Esplanade in a northeast-southwest direction. The street is reasonably wide, and at mid-block the street alignment projects further southeast. Bluestone channel and kerbing extends along each side of the carriageway. Shallow nature strips extend between the kerb and asphalt-surfaced footpaths, these footpaths extend along the street adjacent to property boundaries. Asphalt and concrete-surfaced crossovers provide vehicular access to properties. Mature street trees, mostly plane trees, create a canopy of vegetation over many parts of the street (Refer to Figure 1).

Tiuna Grove was developed from the late-nineteenth century. The late nineteenth century housing is two, substantial, two-storey mansions on the northwest side of the street. The street experienced a significant phase of development in the early-twentieth century, which was in the form of houses (mainly bungalows), and flats (Refer to Figures 2 & 3). In 1915, only three houses were listed in Tiuna Grove, and by 1920 there were 13 houses listed (*Sands & McDougall Melbourne Directories*).

This phase of development defines much of the northwest side of the street, but fine examples of bungalow housing from the early twentieth century are also found at the northeast end of the southeast side of the street (No's 3, 5 and 15). Another bungalow (No 7), of early-twentieth century origin on the southeast side of Tiuna Grove, has been altered, but still contributes to the groups of bungalows found in this street (Refer to Figures 4, 5, 6 & 7).

Construction details of the subject houses are: No 3, built in 1917-18, designed by Richardson & Wood architects; No 5, built 1916, builder A M Younger, who also built Ardoch in Dandenong Road; and No 7, built 1916, builder W E Coleman. The exact date of No 15 is not known, but visually it would appear to be contemporaneous with development that occurred in the 1910s or 20s.

There is a significant amount of mid-late twentieth century flat development, and contemporary development in the street. This includes a late inter-war block of flats, Calgary, (No 13). Another flat complex of the 1960s (No 1), retains an earlier bungalow at its rear (Refer to Figure 8). The blocks of flats of 1960s and 70s origin are Modernist in their expression, and of little or no appreciable heritage value. Contemporary development, of units/apartments, form bookends at the northeast and southwest ends of Tiuna Grove, and these also have no appreciable heritage value.

HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads heritage overlay

The HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct covers a large portion of the south part of Elwood. Tiuna Grove is named after the late-nineteenth century house 'Tiuna' (No 8 Tiuna Grove), which is part of the first phase of development of this heritage overlay. However, it was land sales in the early twentieth century that saw Elwood evolve into a popular bayside residential precinct. The houses at No's 3, 5, 7, and one other No 15, are part of this phase of residential development.



Figure 1: Tiuna Grove, mid-block looking northeast.



Figure 2: Early twentieth century flats on the northwest side of Tiuna Grove currently within the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads heritage overlay.



Figure 3: Early twentieth century house on the northwest side of Tiuna Grove, currently within the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads heritage overlay.



Figure 4: Bungalow at 3 Tiuna Grove proposed for an interim heritage overlay.



Figure 5: Bungalow at 5 Tiuna Grove proposed for an interim heritage overlay.



Figure 6: Bungalow at 15 Tiuna Grove recommended for an interim heritage overlay.



Figure 7: Bungalow at 7 Tiuna Grove proposed for an interim heritage overlay.



Figure 8: An early house in the street is extant behind a block of 1960s flats at 1 Tiuna Grove (indicated with arrow).

In applying the heritage overlay to include additional sites and housing, it is important to understand what are the elements that are intrinsic to a precinct's heritage values. In order to establish this, the statement of significance for the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct will provide guidance.

The statement of significance for the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct identifies this heritage overlay to have historic and aesthetic values. These values are derived from:

The Elwood – Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads Area has historical value (Criterion A) for its capacity to demonstrate the attraction of the Port Phillip Bay coastline as a location for marine villas during the mid-late Victorian period. In this respect it compares with nearby St. Kilda, Brighton and Sandringham which sustained similar coastal development from an early date. It is important also as an Area founded on the first of the Victorian Railways' two "electric street railways" promoted by the premier and minister of Railways Thomas (later Sir Thomas) Bent. The Area has aesthetic value for the diversity of its villas and inter-war apartments often evoking romantic images of the period. Its tree lined streets are also a distinctive characteristic. The juxtaposition of fine commercial and public buildings and spaces at the former Elwood Junction centre has landmark value. The Ormond Road centre assists to underscore the Area's distinctive inter-war character, the former "Broadway theatre" recalling the importance of the suburban picture theatre prior to the advent of television in 1956.

The housing subject to the proposed interim heritage controls, and another at No 15, are part of the historic development of the area in the early twentieth century, which was stimulated by the Victorian Railways electric tramway established in 1906 (closed 1959), and another electric tramway established by the Melbourne and Metropolitan Tramways Board in 1915. Aesthetically, the houses are early and fine examples of mid 1910s bungalows, and 1920s bungalow styles.

ANALYSIS

The HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads heritage overlay extends along the northwest side of Tiuna Grove for its entirety. This side of the street is mostly defined by flats and detached housing from the early twentieth century, of styles representative of that era. Two Victorian mansions on this side of Tiuna Grove, including the mansion 'Tiuna', from which the street derives its name, are also on this northwest side of the street, and form the first phase of residential development.

The southeast side of Tiuna Grove is more eclectic in terms of its built form, with much of this defined by mid-late twentieth century development. A good portion of this built form on the southeast side of the street is Post-war Modernist blocks of flats of little or no appreciable heritage value. The existing boundaries of the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads heritage overlay extend over a portion of the southeast side of Tiuna Grove where contemporary development is now built at the Ormond Esplanade (southwest) end. This is on sites at No's 21-23, 25, 27, 29 and 31 Tiuna Grove. However, where there is a cluster of early twentieth century bungalows in Tiuna Grove, these are not included within the boundaries of the heritage overlay.

This cluster of early twentieth century housing is No's 3, 5, 7 and 15. Another house of early twentieth century origin, No 1, is still extant behind a block of 1960s flats that have been built in its front setback. I am of the view that the houses at No's 3, 5 and 15 are fine and relatively intact examples of twentieth century bungalows and are of significant value to the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct. Change that has occurred to these houses is relatively minor and reversible, and has not impacted upon their significance.

Another house, No 7, has been altered since 2013, when a Google Streetview image was prepared. A box-like addition, of a contemporary expression has now been built to the front of an earlier attic addition visible in the 2013 image. The house, nevertheless, still is interpreted as being from the early twentieth century phase of development, and can be considered to have contributory value to Tiuna Grove and the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct.

Although the house at No 1 is extant, its façade may have been altered or obliterated when the block of flats to its front was built. In any case, if it is intact, it is unlikely the flats will be removed and the house will return to having a presence in this street. On this basis, the house is of non-contributory value to the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct.

CONCLUSION & RECOMMENDATIONS

There are a number of houses on the southeast side of Tiuna Grove, which have heritage values consistent with the aesthetic and historic values of the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct. These houses, No's 3, 5, 7 and 15, are currently outside the boundaries of the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct.

I recommend that City of Port Phillip proceed with the proposed interim heritage controls, which aim to have the boundaries of the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct realigned to include housing at No's 3, 5 and 7. I also recommend that the bungalow at No 15 is also included within the heritage overlay.

I recommend that these houses are given the following gradings in the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct:

- No 3: Significant
- No 5: Significant
- No 7: Contributory
- No 15: Significant

In realigning the boundary of the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct, I suggest Council look at removing the contemporary development at the southwest end of Tiuna Grove from this heritage overlay. These are sites at No's 21-23, 25, 27, 29 and 31 Tiuna Grove. These contemporary developments are of no appreciable heritage value to the precinct.

It is also recommended that the citation for the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads is amended to be consistent with recognised standards of practice in writing statements of significance, as outlined in Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay, August 2018. It should outline, in a concise way, what, how and why the precinct is significant. In discussing why, the precinct is significant, it should note all relevant criteria in brackets.

On the following pages is a draft of a statement of significance for the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads precinct, which outlines in more detail the elements of the precinct that are of significance and should be retained and conserved.

DRAFT STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads

What is Significant?

The south portion of Elwood that has Glenhuntly Road as its east-west spine. It extends to the north to just beyond Shelley Street, between Marine Parade and the Elwood Canal; and to the southeast between Ormond Road and Ormond Esplanade, as far south as to parts of Vautier Street. The area also includes the Point Ormond Reserve and Port Phillip Bay foreshore, south of the Elwood Canal; and the Robinson Gardens recreational reserve.

Some residential development occurred in this area from the 1850s, such as Elwood House (c1855), and later Tiuna (1884) and Thalassa (1889), and a small number of villas. The establishment of an electric tramway by the Victorian Railways in 1906, which extended through Elwood between St Kilda Railway Station and Brighton Beach, stimulated residential development of this area from the early twentieth century. The opening of another electric tramway in 1915, which extended between Elsternwick Railway Station to Point Ormond, operated by the Melbourne & Metropolitan Tramways Board, further improved public transport links to Elwood, and consequently residential development continued to occur in the Inter-war years.

This early twentieth century development (1900-1918) and Inter-war development (1919-1939) is mostly defined by detached brick villas and bungalows, and flats. Underscoring the residential character of this area is the Elwood Shopping Centre at the junction of Broadway, Ormond and Glenhuntly Roads, and another shopping centre further southeast on Ormond Road. They contain commercial and public buildings, including churches, contemporaneous with the residential development that occurred between 1900 and 1939, and established themselves as focal points of community life of this area.

The following features contribute to the significance of the HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads area:

- The Port Phillip Bay foreshore, Point Ormond Reserve and Robinson Reserve;
- Housing from the first phase of residential development from the mid-late nineteenth century;
- Housing and flats from the development of the area in the early twentieth century (1900-1918) and the Inter-war period (1919-1939);
- Commercial, and public buildings, including churches, that were built in tandem with the residential development of the area from the early twentieth century;
- Public realm infrastructure and landscaping that contributes to the fine urban character of this area, such as street trees, bluestone channel and kerbing, and parks and reserves.

How is it Significant?

The HO8 Elwood: Glenhuntly and Ormond Roads area is of local historical (Criterion A), aesthetic (Criterion E), and social (Criterion G) significance to the City of Port Phillip.

Why is it Significant?

The area is of historical significance for the mid-late nineteenth century mansions and villas of this part of Elwood, whose residents were attracted to the area by its location adjacent to the foreshore of Port Phillip Bay. The housing and flats of the precinct of the early twentieth century and Inter-war years demonstrate the second, and most substantial, phase of residential development that was triggered by improved public transport links by the opening of two electric tramways through Elwood in 1906 and 1915 (Criterion A).

The commercial and public buildings, including churches, of the two shopping centres that are contemporaneous with the housing and flats of the early twentieth century and Inter-war years, are of historic significance. They established focal points for this community from the early twentieth century, and are evocative of aspects of life in this suburb as a place to shop, conduct business, worship and to socialise (Criterion A).

Aesthetically, the area is significant as retaining fine and relatively intact collections of housing and flats of the early twentieth century and Inter-war years. These are of styles that are representative of residential design of these years, with Edwardian-era villas and early bungalow designs with Arts & Crafts influences. Inter-war housing and flats demonstrate a broader range of architectural styles, which, in addition to Arts & Crafts, include influences from the West Coast of the United States such as the Californian Bungalow and Spanish Mission-styles; Moderne (Art Deco), and some buildings displaying tenets of emerging European Modernism. This array of architectural styles, within a setting that references garden suburb ideals, has created an area with a rich built form environment within the City of Port Phillip (Criterion E).

The commercial and public buildings of the shopping centres that were built in the early twentieth century and Inter-war years, underscore the surrounding residential character and use of this area. They contribute to the rich built form of this precinct, and are of aesthetic value as a relatively fine and intact collection of commercial and public buildings built prior to World War II. In terms of one shopping centre, it forms a focal point for this broader area and its community at a junction of three major thoroughfares (Criterion E).

The Port Phillip Foreshore, Point Ormond Reserve and Robinson Gardens are of social significance to Port Phillip, as public space and recreational areas that are known, used and valued by the community from the 1850s (Criterion G).

The two shopping centres, as focal points for this local community as a place to shop, conduct business, worship and socialise, are of social significance. They too are places known, used and valued by the local community (Criterion G).



Peter Barrett
Master of Architectural
History & Conservation (Melb.)